Tackling racial and ethnic bias when translating research into policy

JESSICA P. CERDEÑA, MD, PHD

ASSISTANT RESEARCH PROFESSOR, UNIVERSITY OF CONNECTICUT FAMILY RESIDENT PHYSICLAN, MIDDLESEX HEALTH

+ + + + + +

+ + + + + +



There is no race without racism

Racial and ethnic categories do not approximate genetic risk

Racism harms health and biases healthcare

Race-conscious medicine counteracts racism

There is no race without racism

THE ORIGIN OF RACIAL HIERARCHIES IN MEDICINE Blumenbach's five races: Mongolian, American, Caucasian, Malay, Aethiopian (L to R)



Race is a sociopolitical construct inferred to have biological meaning

- Convergence of Enlightenment and Imperialism Eras
- Tool to divide and conquer populations
 - Assert biological inferiority of dark-skinned
 populations
 - Meaning shifts to suit goals of dominant group



in 2000. Americans could include themselves in more than one racial

racial category.

category. Before that, many multiracial people were counted in only one

CLASSIFICATION Latino, Spanish origin

Another Hispanic.

Cuban

Other

Spanish/

Hispanic/

Latino

Other Spanish/

Hispanic

Other

Spanish

È

SSIFICA 2

Race is constructed relative to White hegemony

"slaves"	"Indian"	"free white"	
"free colored persons"	"American Indian"		
"Black"/"Mulatto"/ "Quadroon"/"Octaro on"	"Aleut"/"Eskimo"/ "American Indian"	"White"	
"Negro"	"American Indian" /		
"Black"/"African American"	"Alaska Native		

What is your race or ethnicity? Select all that apply AND enter additional details in the spaces below. Note, you may report more than one group.	□ ASIAN – Provide details below. □ Chinese □ Filipino □ Asian Indian □ Vietnamese □ Korean □ Japanese		
□ German □ Irish □ English □ Italian □ Polish □ French Enter, for example, Scottish, Norwegian, Dutch, etc.	Enter, for example, Pakistani, Cambodian, Hmong, etc. AMERICAN INDIAN OR ALASKA NATIVE – Enter, for example, Navajo Nation, Blackfeet Tribe, Mayan, Aztec, Native Village of Barrow Inupiat Tribal Government, Tlingit, etc.		
HISPANIC OR LATINO – Provide details below. Mexican or Mexican American Puerto Rican Salvadoran Dominican Enter, for example, Guatemalan, Spaniard, Ecuadorian, etc.	Image: Middle Eastern or North African – Provide details below. Lebanese Iranian Syrian Moroccan Israeli Enter, for example, Algerian, Iraqi, Kurdish, etc.		
BLACK OR AFRICAN AMERICAN – Provide details below. African American Jamaican Nigerian Ethiopian Enter, for example, Ghanaian, South African, Barbadian, etc.	NATIVE HAWAIIAN OR PACIFIC ISLANDER – Provide details below. Native Hawaiian Samoan Tongan Fijian Arshallese Enter, for example, Palauan, Tahitian, Chuukese, etc.		

Example initial proposal for combining race-ethnicity question for Office of Management and Budget Statistical Standards

Changing racial categories show political nature

Treating race UR as a clinical category or research variable is engaging in racism

Racial and ethnic categories do not approximate genetic risk

DISENTANGLING RACE FROM GENETICS



Imagine treating a White Swiss patient with gout

American College of Rheumatology

Empowering Rheumatology Professionals

Testing for the HLA–B*5801 allele prior to starting allopurinol is conditionally recommended for patients of Southeast Asian descent (e.g., Han Chinese, Korean, Thai) and for African American patients, over not testing for the HLA–B*5801 allele.

Universal testing for the HLA–B*5801 allele prior to starting allopurinol is conditionally recommended *against* in patients of other ethnic or racial background over testing for the HLA–B*5801 allele.

A US and Asian populations

Screen African American but not White people?



Screen Swiss people from Basel, not Bern?



B Cities in Switzerland

Racial & ethnic categories influence data interpretation 000

 O_4

What about Tay Sachs? Sickle cell?

- Few diseases driven by single point mutations
- Mendelian diseases occur more frequently in restricted gene pools patterned by social and reproductive isolation
- Common diseases less influenced by selection



Genetic diversity derives from serial founder effects

Recurrent "bottlenecks" reduce genetic diversity with increasing distance from East Africa







There is no "African" or "European" ancestry

DISEASE PHENOTYPE



CERDEÑA, GRUBBS, NON. (2022). THE LANCET.

Pathway A: gene linked to disease → "it's genetic"
Pathway B: dark skin gene + disease gene → "it's ancestry"
Pathway C: dark skin ↑ racism ↑ disease → "it's racism"

We should measure genetic similarity & social environment

LEGEND

- Preferred population descriptor(s)
- In some cases; refer to Ch. 5 text and the decision tree in Appendix D
- - Descriptors could be used if appropriate E proxies for environmental, not genetic, effects

Should not be used

GENOMICS STUDY TYPE	Race	Ethnicity/ Indigeneity	Geography	Genetic Ancestry	Genetic Similarity	Notes
1: Gene Discovery - Mendelian Traits		?	?	?	Ŧ	Similarity suffices as a genetic measure; at fine-scale, other variables may be useful
2: Trait Prediction - Mendelian Traits		Ξ	8	?	Ð	No population descriptors may be necessary for analysis
3: Gene Discovery - Complex Traits		E	E	?	Ð	Similarity suffices as a genetic measure
4: Trait Prediction - Complex Traits		E	E	?	Ð	Similarity suffices as a genetic measure
5: Cellular and Physiological Mechanisms		E	E		?	No population descriptors may be necessary for analysis
6: Health Disparities with Genomic Data	E	8	E	?	8	Not all health disparities studies rely on descent-associated population groupings, so none may be necessary for analysis
7: Human Evolutionary History		?	+	Đ	Ð	Reconstructing genetic ancestry may be of central interest

Racism harms health and biases healthcare

THE DANGERS OF RACE-BASED MEDICINE

Race is not genetic, but racism affects health

RACE ≠ GENETICS

Biomedicine often believes this

$\begin{array}{c} \mathsf{RACISM} \to \mathsf{RACE} \to \to \\ \mathsf{BIOLOGY} \end{array}$

This is what's happening



Racism shapes the way we collect and interpret data

research questions & hypotheses

sampling methods and sample size size variability

terminology

• conflation of race, ethnicity, ancestry, and geography

analytical methods

• descriptive, covariate, stratification

conclusion & recommendation

Race-based guidelines undermine patient autonomy

"Hypertension in Blacks is a salt disease," Dr. Anderson explained. "We'll start her on a diuretic and see how she does."

"Doc, I'm a bus driver," our patient said. "I don't want to be on something that's going to make me have to go to the bathroom. I don't get breaks."

Cerdeña. (2021) A J Bioethics.





Whom would you start on a divretic?



Cerdeña et al. JGIM (forthcoming)

Race-based medical algorithms misunderstand race as a risk factor rather than a risk marker



prompt: "difficult patient"

Artificial intelligence and large language models recapitulate colonial power hierarchies

prompt: "physician"

DALLE3, Open Al.

Race-conscious medicine counteracts racism

THE ROLE OF POLICY ADVOCACY

Race-conscious medicine emphasizes how racism determines illness & health



Cerdeña, Plaisime, Tsai. (2020). The Lancet.



Race-conscious research aims for justice



Policy advocaci should dismantle receives

We need to end scientific racism to achieve health justice

